

HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

Council Chambers, City Hall
70 Maple Street
Manistee, MI 49660

MEETING MINUTES

May 7, 2009

A Meeting of the Manistee City Historic District Commission was held on Thursday, May 7, 2009 at 3:00 p.m. in the Council Chambers, City Hall, 70 Maple Street, Manistee, Michigan.

Meeting was called to order at 3:04 p.m. by Chair Kracht.

ROLL CALL:

Members Present: Dave Carlson, Maria DeRee, Teena Kracht, Nathaniel Neider, Kelly Niles, John Perschbacher

Members Absent: T. Eftaxiadis (excused), Mallory Barkholz (Youth Observer)

Others: Travis Alden (DDA/Main Street Director), Mark & Christina Chmura (308 River Street), Tom Amor Jr. (Amor Sign Studios), Jerry Pitcher (401 River Street), John Ball (135 Washington Street), Jon Rose (Community Development), Steve Harold (Manistee County Historical Museum) and Denise Blakeslee (Planning & Zoning) and others

APPROVAL OF AGENDA:

MOTION by John Perschbacher, seconded by Dave Carlson that the Agenda for the May 7, 2009 Meeting be approved.

With a Voice Vote Motion passed unanimously

APPROVAL OF MINUTES:

MOTION by John Perschbacher, seconded by Maria DeRee that the Minutes of the April 2, 2009 Meeting be approved.

With a Voice Vote Motion passed unanimously

NEW BUSINESS:

Evarard Dominy/Port City Candy Company, 431 River Street - Signage HDC-2009-06 & Screening for Air Conditioner HDC-2009-07

Signage

A request has been received from Evarard Dominy/Port City Candy Company, 431 River Street for a Certificate of Appropriateness for signage as submitted with Application HDC-2009-06. Proposed signage includes a wall sign, projecting sign, lighted "Open" sign, Flag and portable signs.

MOTION by John Perschbacher, seconded by Maria DeRee to approve the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for signage as submitted with Application HDC-2009-06 with the condition that only one "OPEN" lighted sign, one flag and one portable sign be allowed.

With a roll call vote this motion passed 6 to 0.

Yes: Carlson, Niles, DeRee, Perschbacher, Neider, Kracht

No: None

Screening for Air Conditioner

A request has been received from Evarard Dominy/Port City Candy Company, 431 River Street for a Certificate of Appropriateness for screening of an Air Conditioner as submitted with Application HDC-2009-07. An Air Conditioner was installed on the roof of the building in accordance with Policy #12. The applicant is now requesting approval for screening as required in Policy #12.

MOTION by Dave Carlson, seconded by Kelly Niles to approve the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for screening of an Air Conditioner as submitted with Application HDC-2009-07.

MOTION by John Perschbacher, seconded by Nathaniel Neider to amend motion with the condition that the enclosure be constructed with painted wood lattice using a diagonal pattern with final approval by the Museum Director.

With a roll call vote motion to amend original motion passed 6 to 0.

Yes: Perschbacher, Niles, DeRee, Neider, Carlson, Kracht

No: None

With a roll call vote **motion to approve the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for screening of an Air Conditioner as submitted with Application HDC-2009-07 with the condition that the enclosure be constructed with painted wood lattice using a diagonal pattern with final approval by the Museum Director** passed 6 to 0.

Yes: Carlson, Neider, DeRee, Niles, Perschbacher, Kracht

No: None

Amor Sign Studios/Suvi's, 419 River Street - Signage HDC-2009-08

Commissioner Niles declared a conflict of interest and removed himself from the Commission.

A request has been received from Amor Sign Studios/Suvi's, 419 River Street for a Certificate of Appropriateness for signage as submitted with Application HDC-2009-08. Proposed signage includes two window signs and replacement of faces on A-Frame sign.

MOTION by Dave Carlson, seconded by John Perschbacher to approve the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for signage as submitted with Application HDC-2009-08.

With a roll call vote this motion passed 5 to 0 with Commissioner Niles abstaining due to a conflict of interest.

Yes: DeRee, Carlson, Perschbacher, Neider, Kracht
No: None

Commissioner Niles returned to his seat.

Amor Sign Studios/Mark Chmura, Pier Pressure Charters, 308 River Street - Signage HDC-2009-09

Window/Wall Signage

A request has been received from Amor Sign Studios/Mark Chmura, Pier Pressure Charters, 308 River Street for a Certificate of Appropriateness for signage as submitted with Application HDC-2009-09. Proposed signage includes installation of Window Sign on River Street, and new wall sign on Division Street. Both of these signs meet the requirements of the Zoning Ordinance.

MOTION by John Perschbacher, seconded by Maria DeRee that the request be divided into two parts (Window/ Wall sign and Roof sign)

With a voice vote Motion passed unanimously

Window/Wall Sign

MOTION by Dave Carlson, seconded by Kelly Niles to approve the request from Amor Sign Studios/Mark Chmura, Pier Pressure Charters, for a Certificate of Appropriateness for a window sign on 308 River Street and a new wall sign on Division Street as submitted with Application HDC-2009-09 that meets the requirements of the Zoning Ordinance.

With a roll call vote this motion passed 6 to 0.

Yes: Carlson, Neider, Perschbacher, Niles, DeRee, Kracht
No: None

Roof Sign

This application also includes a 319.66 sq. ft. Roof Sign, which does not meet the requirements of the Zoning Ordinance. While a variance is required under the Zoning Ordinance, the application includes an undated photograph of a roof sign that was previously located at this building. There is no documentation as to the date when the roof sign was installed, removed or if the sign was an original part of the building.

Steve Harold said that the photo was verified from a yearbook ad from 1951. City Directory showed that the dealership advertised on the sign was in business from 1932-1954. There is no documentation that demonstrates the sign was an original feature of the building when it was constructed in 1925.

Mark Chmura spoke of the sign being on the building and showed a the picture that was submitted and spoke of Tom Amor's grandfather repainting the sign in 1943. He said the sign was removed sometime in the 1950's.

A staff report had been prepared (attached).

The Commission discussed that the applicant did not demonstrate that the sign was an original part of the building when the building was constructed.

MOTION by Maria DeRee, seconded by John Perschbacher to deny the request from Amor Sign Studios/Mark Chmura, Pier Pressure Charters, for a Roof Sign as submitted with Application HDC-2009-09. The reason for denial is that the sign does not meet the requirements of the City of Manistee Zoning Ordinance, the requirements of the Secretary of the Interior's Guidelines, and the requirements of the Preservation Brief 25: the Preservation of Historic Signs.

With a roll call vote this motion passed 6 to 0.

Yes: Perschbacher, Neider, Carlson, Niles, DeRee, Kracht

No: None

John Ball, 135 Washington Street - Facade Improvements HDC-2009-10

A request has been received from John Ball, 135 Washington Street for a Certificate of Appropriateness for facade improvements as submitted with Application HDC-2009-10. The Commission broke the request down into consensus votes on each item listed on the request and discussed each element with Mr. Ball.

Discussion by the Commission, Applicant and Staff resulted in a consensus vote as follows:

Remove 6 rows of sand brick and replace with new red brick along bottom of building.

Consensus Vote - to allow the removal of 6 rows of sand brick and replace with new red brick along the bottom of the building with the condition that the brick and mortar used must comply with Preservation Brief #2 "*Repointing Motor Joints in Historic Masonry Buildings*" with final approval by the Museum Director. - Unanimous

Remove existing store front and replace with same, new wood trim etc.

Applicant was asked if the new entrance was going to handicap accessible. Mr. Ball said that it will be.

Consensus Vote - to allow the removal of existing store front and replace with same, new wood trim etc.
- Unanimous

Change front entrance from a flat front, to a walk in entrance

Consensus Vote - to change front entrance from a flat front, to a walk in entrance. - Unanimous

Install three new awnings to comply with color and style required.

Noted that it appears that the original awning hardware is still intact on the building. Commission encouraged the re-use of the original hardware. Noted that the upper awnings did not appear to meet the awning standards. Building permits are required for awnings. Application did not include any signage.

Consensus Vote - to allow the installation of three new awnings that meet the requirements of the Historic District Commission Awning Guidelines. Awnings are to be approved by the Museum Director along with the fabric and colors. The original awning hardware, if not used, is to remain unless it is a safety issue as determined by the Building Inspector. No Signage can be installed on the awning without a Sign Permit and Historic District Commission approval. - Unanimous

Replace Iron Rail on the second story balcony.

Consensus Vote - to allow the replacement of the iron rail on the second story balcony that meets the requirements of the building code with final approval by the Building Inspector and Museum Director. - Unanimous

Replace second story windows, with wood sash or appropriate replacement's code or better.

Consensus Vote - to allow the replacement of three second story windows on the South side of the building and two second story windows on the North side of the building with wooden double hung windows that match the original windows. Final approval of windows will be required from the Museum Director if determined by the Building Inspector and Museum Director that the existing windows cannot be repaired.
- Unanimous

Remove T-1-11 siding from the rear addition and replace with T-1-11 on 8" centers. Instead of T-1-11 on 12" centers that is no longer manufactured.

After a lengthy discussion about the difference between repair and replacement and restoration.

Consensus Vote - to allow the removal of T-1-11 siding from the rear addition and replace with T-1-11 on 8" centers. Instead of T-1-11 on 12" centers. With the recommendation that battens be added.
- Consensus 5(DeRee, Niles, Neider, Perschbacher, Carlson) - 1 (Kracht).

MOTION by Maria DeRee, seconded by Dave Carlson to approve the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for facade improvements as submitted with Application HDC-2009-10 as follows:

To allow the removal of 6 rows of sand brick and replace with new red brick along the bottom of the building with the condition that the brick and mortar used must comply with Preservation Brief #2 "*Repointing Motor Joints in Historic Masonry Buildings*" with final approval by the Museum Director.

To allow the removal of existing store front and replace with same, new wood trim etc.

To change front entrance from a flat front, to a walk in entrance.

To allow the installation of three new awnings that meet the requirements of the Historic District Commission Awning Guidelines. Awnings are to be approved by the Museum Director along with the fabric and colors. The original awning hardware if not used is to remain unless it is a safety issue as determined by the Building Inspector. No Signage can be installed on the awning without Historic District Commission approval.

To allow the replacement of the iron rail on the second story balcony that meets the requirements of the building code with final approval by the Building Inspector and Museum Director.

To allow the replacement of three second story windows on the South side of the building and two second story windows on the North side of the building with wooden double hung windows that match the original windows. Final approval of windows will be required from the Museum Director if determined by the Building Inspector and Museum Director that the existing windows cannot be repaired.

To allow the removal of T-1-11 siding from the rear addition and replace with T-1-11 on 8" centers. Instead of T-1-11 on 12" centers. With the recommendation that battens be added.

With a roll call vote this motion passed 6 to 0.

Yes: Perschbacher, Carlson, Neider, DeRee, Niles, Kracht
No: None

Draft Policy #13 - Murals

The Historic District Commission postponed action on this agenda item until the June 4, 2009 meeting due to the late hour.

OLD BUSINESS

None

PUBLIC COMMENTS AND COMMUNICATIONS CONCERNING ITEMS NOT ON THE AGENDA

Jerry Pitcher, 401 River Street. Mr. Pitcher is asking the Historic District Commission about the replacement of the Windows at 401 River Street. Several of the windows are rotted beyond repair and he has found a contractor who is able to replicate the windows.

John Raven from the Raven Company in Grand Rapids showed samples of the proposed windows to the Commissioners. The commission did not have any concerns about the proposed windows.

Tom Amor Jr. would like the commission to hold two meetings a month during the summer; requested that the applicant be allowed to speak first on requests; expressed concern that staff and Chair Kracht speaking with SHPO Architect Robb McKay violated the open meeting act; that the roof sign was authenticated by the historical evidence they presented; that Historic District Commission should be abolished.

Mark Chmura said the Commission did not give him reasons for denying the request. Mr. Rose said he will receive a copy of the meeting minutes and the motion contains the reason for denial.

CORRESPONDENCE

Jon Rose sent the Commissioners a memo regarding the signage for Manistee Insurance. A Certificate of Appropriateness was issued to Manistee Insurance on September 5, 2008 for awnings and signage. A condition of approval was that "The two pre-existing internally lit signs must be removed prior to installation of new signage." After inspection of the installation of the new awning/signage it was notice that the two pre-existing internally lit signs are no longer lit, but remain in the window. The Historic District Commission directed Jon Rose to send a letter to Manistee Insurance.

STAFF REPORTS

Travis Alden, Main Street/DDA Director spoke to the Commissioners about the DDA Facade Grant Application. The application currently requires review/approval from the Historic District Commission for projects outside the Historic District. Now the Main Street has established a sub-committee the Main Street Design Committee which currently has members of the Historic District Commission serving on the Committee. Mr. Alden asked if future DDA Facade Grant Applications for projects outside of the district could be run through Main Street Design Committee instead of the Historic District Commission. The members of the Historic District Commission were in favor of the change in the process for buildings outside of the Historic District. The Historic District will continue to review requests for projects in the Historic District.

Steve Harold issued a Certificate of Appropriateness for paint colors at 440 River Street. The Body of the building will be painted "Indian Corn" on the sides and back, the trim will be "Newburyport Blue" and the Deck will be "Shale". This project will be assigned #HDC-2009-11.

The Historic District Commission has schedule a Worksession for Thursday, May 21, 2009 at 3:00 p.m. The Commissioners will walk the Historic District during the Worksession in support of the Non-Motorized Transportation Committee's "Healthy Active Manistee" program.

The Next meeting of the Historic District Commission will be on Thursday, June 4, 2009 at 3:00 p.m. in the Council Chambers, City Hall, 70 Maple Street. A worksession will be held after the meeting is over.

Commissioner Niles said that his term is up and he will be sending in a letter of resignation. Kelly has enjoyed working with the commission but has work obligations at this time that do not allow him to continue to serve on the Commission.

The Commissioners wished Kelly the best and he will be missed.

ADJOURNMENT:

MOTION by Maria DeRee, seconded by Dave Carlson that the meeting be adjourned. Motion passed unanimously.

MEETING ADJOURNED AT 5:27 P.M.

MANISTEE HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

Denise J. Blakeslee, Recording Secretary